

1 DONALD SPECTER – 083925
STEVEN FAMA – 099641
2 MARGOT MENDELSON – 268583
PRISON LAW OFFICE
3 1917 Fifth Street
Berkeley, California 94710-1916
4 Telephone: (510) 280-2621

MICHAEL W. BIEN – 096891
JEFFREY L. BORNSTEIN – 099358
ERNEST GALVAN – 196065
THOMAS NOLAN – 169692
LISA ELLS – 243657
JENNY S. YELIN – 273601
MICHAEL S. NUNEZ – 280535
JESSICA WINTER – 294237
MARC J. SHINN-KRANTZ – 312968
CARA E. TRAPANI – 313411
ALEXANDER GOURSE – 321631
ROSEN BIEN
GALVAN & GRUNFELD LLP
101 Mission Street, Sixth Floor
San Francisco, California 94105-1738
Telephone: (415) 433-6830

9 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
12 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

14 RALPH COLEMAN, et al.,
15 Plaintiffs,
16 v.
17 GAVIN NEWSOM, et al.,
18 Defendants.

Case No. 2:90-CV-00520-KJM-DB

**DECLARATION OF MARC STERN,
M.D. IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS’
MOTION**

Judge: Hon. Kimberly J. Mueller

1 **DECLARATION OF MARC STERN, M.D.**

2 I, Marc Stern, declare as follows:

3 1. I am a physician, board-certified in internal medicine, specializing in
4 correctional health care. I most recently served as the Assistant Secretary for Health Care
5 at the Washington State Department of Corrections. I served for four years as a medical
6 subject matter expert for the Officer of Civil Rights and Civil Liberties, U.S. Department
7 of Homeland Security, and as a medical subject matter expert for one year for the
8 California Attorney General’s division responsible for monitoring the conditions of
9 confinement in Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) detention facilities. I am a
10 court-appointed medical expert in the class action *Parsons v. Ryan*, CV-12-00601-PHX-
11 ROS. Currently, I am the Medical Advisor for the National Sheriffs’ Association on
12 matters related to preventive measures responding to COVID-19. Additionally, in 2009, at
13 the request of the California Receiver Clark Kelso, I toured 10 California State Prisons to
14 assess whether or not the Receiver’s assignment – to restore the delivery of health services
15 within the California State Prisons – to constitutionally adequate levels – had been
16 completed. Attached as **Exhibit A** is a copy of my curriculum vitae.

17 **COVID-19 FACTS**

18 2. COVID-19 is a serious disease and has reached pandemic status. Over 1.4
19 million people around the world have received confirmed diagnoses of COVID-19 as of
20 April 7, 2020, including 374,329 people in the United States. COVID-19 is a novel virus.
21 It is very easily spread from person to person, and people can become infected by simply
22 touching surfaces with the virus after the person with the virus has left the area.

23 3. There is no vaccine for COVID-19, nor is there a cure. The time course of
24 the disease can be very rapid. Individuals can show the first symptoms of infection in as
25 little as two days after exposure and their condition can seriously deteriorate in as little as
26 five days (perhaps sooner) after that.

27 4. The effects of COVID-19 are very serious, especially for people who are
28 most vulnerable. Vulnerable people include people over the age of 50, and those of any

1 age with underlying health problems such as – but not limited to – weakened immune
2 systems, hypertension, diabetes, blood, lung, kidney, heart, and liver disease, and possibly
3 pregnancy.

4 5. Vulnerable people who are infected by the COVID-19 virus can experience
5 severe respiratory illness, as well as damage to other major organs, and death. Treatment
6 for serious cases of COVID-19 requires significant advanced support, including ventilator
7 assistance for respiration and intensive care support.

8 **CONDITIONS IN CDCR FACILITIES**

9 6. The California Department of Corrections houses over 116,000 people in
10 facilities built for 89,663. Incarcerated people live in congregate living facilities, with
11 more than a third living in open and crowded dormitories. I have reviewed the Weekly
12 Population Report posted on the website of the CDCR at
13 [https://www.cdcr.ca.gov/research/wp-](https://www.cdcr.ca.gov/research/wp-content/uploads/sites/174/2020/03/Tpop1d200318.pdf)
14 [content/uploads/sites/174/2020/03/Tpop1d200318.pdf](https://www.cdcr.ca.gov/research/wp-content/uploads/sites/174/2020/03/Tpop1d200318.pdf). This report shows that the
15 California state prisons remain at 130% of capacity. Among the 35 state prisons, all but
16 four are over 100% capacity, and 19 are at or over 130% of design capacity, with eight
17 over 150% capacity. Among the four which are below capacity, their occupancies are still
18 high, from a public health standpoint: 90.9%, 96.2%, 97.3%, and 99.7%.

19 7. The living units at many of these prisons are clearly too crowded. I have
20 reviewed photographs taken in 2019 and provided to me by plaintiffs' counsel of living
21 areas and day rooms in four prisons: Central California Women's Facility, California
22 Institution for Men, California Medical Facility, and the Substance Abuse Treatment
23 Facility at Corcoran. I also reviewed a CDCR Institutional Bed Audit dated March 23,
24 2020 that shows that many of the CDCR dormitories are very crowded. For example, at
25 Avenal State Prison, all people are housed in dormitories designed to house 50-100 people.
26 Most of those dormitories are currently at 150% capacity. At the Central California
27 Women's Facility, some of the dormitories are as much as 194% overcrowded.

28

1 8. The level of crowding in the California state prisons, as evidenced by the
2 population reports, the Institutional Bed Audit and the photographs I reviewed, is very
3 significant and dangerous from a public health standpoint. These crowded conditions,
4 particularly in the dormitories, make it virtually impossible to maintain physical distance
5 from others, as recommended by the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.

6 9. In addition to the lack of space, the dormitories that I personally viewed, and
7 have viewed through photographs, are laid in such a way that requires their occupants to
8 touch shared surfaces such as sinks, faucets, toilet flushers, and door handles.

9 10. I have also reviewed the California Receiver’s Statewide Dashboards that
10 report various health care metrics for the state’s prisons. According to the most recent
11 dashboard posted at [cchcs.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/60/QM/Public-Dashboard-](https://cchcs.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/60/QM/Public-Dashboard-2019-10.pdf)
12 [2019-10.pdf](https://cchcs.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/60/QM/Public-Dashboard-2019-10.pdf), 14.7% of the people in the state prisons, i.e., over 17,000 people, are
13 classified as medically “high risk.” According to the CCHCS Health Care Department
14 Operations Manual, patients are classified as “high risk” if they suffer from serious health
15 conditions that require case management.¹ The health conditions CCHCS uses to

16
17 ¹ According to the CCHCS Health Care Department Operations Manual 1.2.14, Appx. 1,
18 section (c)(3)(c), people are classified in the CDCR as “high risk” if they have the
19 following conditions: “Chronic care of complicated, unstable, or poorly-controlled
20 common conditions (e.g., asthma with history of intubation for exacerbations,
21 uncompensated end-stage liver disease, hypertension with end-organ damage, diabetes
22 with amputation). Chronic care of complex, unusual, or high risk conditions (e.g., cancer
23 under treatment or metastatic, coronary artery disease with prior infarction). Implanted
24 defibrillator or pacemaker. High risk medications (e.g., chemotherapy, immune
25 suppressants, Factor 8 or 7, anticoagulants other than aspirin). Transportation over a
26 several day period would pose a health risk, such as hypercoagulable state. Case
27 management is required.”
28

1 designate patients as “high risk” are almost identical to those used by the U.S. Centers for
2 Disease Control and Prevention to determine who is at elevated risk for complications
3 from COVID-19 infection.

4 11. California’s crowded prisons house thousands of people who are at high risk
5 for serious health consequences if they are infected with COVID-19. An outbreak of
6 COVID-19 in any prison where community health resources are already stressed by
7 COVID-19 will put significant pressure on or exceed the capacity of local health
8 infrastructure. To the extent that the health care infrastructure is overloaded, incarcerated
9 people and local people from the community will die unnecessarily because necessary
10 respirators and hospital facilities are unavailable.

11 12. Based on the crowded conditions, coupled with the increased concentration
12 of people with high risk of complications, including death, from COVID-19, incarcerated
13 people in California state prisons are at an extraordinary risk of dying from the COVID-19
14 virus.

15 **MITIGATION MEASURES**

16 13. To mitigate the impact of this pandemic in the prisons, the CDCR must
17 identify those people who are at highest risk for severe complications from the virus and
18 ensure that they are safely situated, either by releasing them or ensuring that they are safely
19 housed where they can best practice physical distancing and otherwise reduce the
20 opportunities for infection to the extent possible. This will reduce the number of people
21 who are likely to become seriously ill should they become infected and require treatment at
22 the community hospital.

23 14. I further recommend taking immediate and concerted efforts to downsize the
24 population to the lowest number possible at each prison, and particularly those with
25 crowded dormitories. This process should prioritize rehousing outside the prison system,
26 or releasing those who are elderly or have underlying medical conditions defined by the
27 CDC and can safely be released consistent with public safety. This process will permit
28 greater flexibility when prisons have outbreaks and require space to isolate and/or

1 quarantine people. This will also permit those people remaining in prison to have greater
2 opportunities to physically distance themselves, in keeping with the CDC Guidelines.

3 15. In addition to recommending every effort towards immediate downsizing, I
4 also recommend that the prisons begin planning now to downsize further as conditions
5 change. The change in conditions we need to anticipate is reduction in workforce (custody
6 and health care staff) as workers respond to their personal needs (self-quarantine or
7 isolation, caring for ill relatives, staying home with school-age children). Insufficient
8 custody staffing poses an obvious risk to the safety of the institution. Insufficient health
9 care staffing poses an obvious risk to the health of residents.

10 16. Taking immediate and concerted efforts to implement preventive steps as
11 well as reducing the population to the lowest number possible to avoid infection benefits
12 the incarcerated population, the staff and the community. Priority should be given to those
13 who are elderly or have underlying medical conditions defined by the CDC. These
14 measures will increase public safety via reducing public health risk.

15 Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is
16 true and correct. Executed this 8th day in April, 2020 in Tumwater, Washington.

17
18 

19 _____
20 Marc Stern, M.D.
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28